

Chief Judge Marsha J. Pechman

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT SEATTLE

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, )  
 )  
Plaintiff, )  
 )  
v. )  
 )  
HENRY ROSENAU, )  
 )  
Defendant. )

NO. CR06-157MJP

GOVERNMENT'S OPPOSITION  
TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO  
COMPEL MLAT MATERIALS  
AND SEALED COURT  
DOCUMENTS

Noted: April 20, 20102

The United States of America, by and through Jenny A. Durkan, United States Attorney for the Western District of Washington, and Susan M. Roe and Marc A. Perez, Assistant United States Attorneys for said District, and files this opposition to the defendant's Motion to Compel which asks for (1) materials of the United State Government to Canadian Government request, made pursuant to the Mutual Legal Assistance Treaty between the two sovereigns, in an international facilitation of prosecuting criminals and (2) sealed court and grand jury documents. Dkt # 102.

1 The defendant has a right to certain discoverable materials. Federal Rule of Criminal  
 2 Procedure 16 and Local Rule 16 list the required production,<sup>1</sup> of which a relevant section is  
 3 (A)(1) (E) **Documents and Objects**. Upon a defendant's request, the  
 4 government must permit the defendant to inspect and to copy or photograph  
 5 books, papers, documents, data, photographs, tangible objects, buildings or places, or copies  
 6 of portions of any of these items, if the items are within the government's possession, custody,  
 7 or control and

8 (i) the item is material to preparing the defense;

9 (ii) the government intends to use the item in its case-in-chief at trial ; or

10 (iii) the item was obtained from or belongs to the defendant.

11  
 12 Another relevant section is Rule 16 (a)(2). **Information Not Subject to Disclosure**. Except  
 13 as Rule 16(a)(1) provides otherwise, this rule does not authorize the discovery or inspection  
 14 of reports, memoranda, or other internal government documents made by an attorney for the  
 15 government or other government agent in connection with investigating or prosecuting the  
 16 case.

17 The defense appears to be requesting internal government documents which relate to  
 18 the preparation, writing, revising, consulting on and presenting of the United States' official  
 19 MLAT request to Canada. These are all internal government documents which are not  
 20 discoverable under Rule 16 or are properly provided by the prosecution in a criminal case.

21 Whether a Canadian is entitled to receive MLAT documents from his government is a  
 22 matter to be decided in Canada. The United States has no basis to involve itself in a  
 23 Canadian citizen's request of his government and has inadequate knowledge of the Canadian  
 24 laws on that matter.

---

25  
 26  
 27 <sup>1</sup>There is no claim that the requested materials would be discoverable pursuant as *Jencks*,  
 28 *Brady* or *Giglio* matters.

1 Generally, however, according to the Office of International Affairs, Department of  
 2 Justice, the governments view MLAT requests as confidential and protected sovereign  
 3 speech and not open to individual claims or causes of action.

4 Therefore, the internal DOJ memoranda reports, drafts, and other internal documents  
 5 relating to the United States' request under the MLAT are not discoverable in a criminal  
 6 case. Any claim in the Canadian court is better handled within Canada.

7 The defendant also requests that the sealed documents relating to Zachary Miraback  
 8 be released to him and, alternatively, be preserved for appeal. The government objects to the  
 9 release of the documents as a violation of Mr. Miraback's privacy and further notes that this  
 10 Court has reviewed the documents *in camera* and found no *Brady* or *Giglio* materials  
 11 contained within. The defendant has not established any basis for unsealing court documents  
 12 of something other than a witness in this case. Therefore, the documents should remain  
 13 sealed.

14 DATED this 19th day of April, 2012.

15 Respectfully submitted,

16  
 17 JENNY A. DURKAN  
 18 United States Attorney

19  
 20 s/Susan M. Roe  
 21 SUSAN M. ROE  
 22 Assistant United States Attorney  
 23 United States Attorney's Office  
 24 700 Stewart Street, Suite 5220  
 25 Seattle, WA 98101-1271  
 26 Telephone: (206) 553-1077  
 27 Fax: (206) 553-0755  
 28 E-mail: [susan.roe@usdoj.gov](mailto:susan.roe@usdoj.gov)

s/Marc A. Perez

Marc A. Perez

United States Attorney's Office

1201 Pacific Avenue

Suite 700

Tacoma, Washington 98402

Telephone: (253) 428-3822

Fax: (253) 428-3826

Email: [Marc.Perez@usdoj.gov](mailto:Marc.Perez@usdoj.gov)

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 19, 2012, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the attorney(s) of record for the defendant(s). I hereby certify that I have served the attorney(s) of record for the defendant(s) that are non CM/ECF participants via telefax.

s/SUSAN M. ROE

SUSAN M. ROE

United States Attorney's Office

700 Stewart Street, Suite 5220

Seattle, Washington 98101

Phone: 206-553-1077

FAX: 206-553-0755

E-mail: [susan.roe@usdoj.gov](mailto:susan.roe@usdoj.gov)